



**TARHEEL FORENSIC LEAGUE  
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING  
Northwest Guilford High School  
Saturday, May 15, 2010**

**2009-2010 Committee Meeting**

I. Meeting was called to order by Keith Pittman (Chair) at 9:10 am.

- Members in attendance:
  - Keith Pittman (Chair)
  - Suzanne Sell (Vice-Chair)
  - Melissa Cain
  - Chris Rocca
  - Brigitte Cain (Treasurer)
  - Andrew West (arrived at 9:35 am)
- Members not in attendance:
  - J. Patrick Moss (Historian)
  - Libby Carter
  - Shannon Jarman

II. Brigitte Cain presented the Treasurer's report showing a balance of \$4711.21.

- Accepted by unanimous consent

III. Committee voted to combine the discussion of the 2010 TFL State Championship tournament with the new committee's business.

IV. Committee voted to discuss any recommendations for the new committee with the new committee's business.

V. The two outgoing members of the 2009-2010 committee (Andrew West and Shannon Jarman) were not present for recognition.

VI. There was no additional old business.

VII. Meeting was adjourned at 9:30 am.

**2010-2011 Committee Meeting**

I. Meeting was called to order at 9:30 am by Keith Pittman (acting Chair).

- Members in attendance:
  - Keith Pittman
  - Melissa Cain
  - Scott Bennett
  - Chris Rocca

- Suzanne Sell
- Brigitte Cain
- Members not in attendance:
  - Libby Carter
  - J. Patrick Moss
  - Jason Kline

## II. Election of officers

- Chair
  - Motion to elect Keith Pittman by Chris Rocca; second by Scott Bennett
  - Unanimous consent to elect
- Vice-Chair
  - Motion to elect Suzanne Sell by Melissa Cain; second by Scott Bennett
  - Unanimous consent to elect
- Secretary
  - Motion to combine seat of secretary with seat of treasurer for 2010-2011 school year by Suzanne Sell; second by Melissa Cain
    - Passed by unanimous consent
  - Motion to elect Brigitte Cain by Suzanne Sell; second by Scott Bennett
    - Unanimous consent to elect
- Historian
  - Motion to elect Melissa Cain by Suzanne Sell; second by Chris Rocca
  - Unanimous consent to elect

## III. Leon Pfeiffer, Executive Director of the NC Association for Scholastic Activities (NCASA), presented information concerning the association and invitation for TFL to partner with NCASA

- The association:
  - Is non-profit
  - Has 17 board members on the board of directors
  - Was incorporated in March 2010
  - Passed its bylaws in April 2010
  - Will elect officers in May/June 2010
  - Is similar to the NC High School Athletic Association in that it is actively seeking a sponsor for a “cup” (similar to the Wachovia Cup for athletics) to award to a member school for achievement in scholastic activities
  - Currently has three activities that it will offer to member schools: Quiz Bowl, an on-demand writing competition, and a general knowledge competition called “Twelve”
  - Would like to offer “partnerships” to seven other activities: NC Economics Challenge, NC Math Competition, Science Olympiad, Odyssey of the Mind, Envirathon, Mock Trial, and TFL
    - These seven organizations will not lose autonomy over their own competitions
  - Schools will most likely have to pay a yearly fee to be members of the NCASA
    - Fees could range from nothing to \$.50 per enrolled student at the school
  - An informal survey of all principals of high schools in North Carolina determined that anywhere from 350-500 schools may consider joining the organization

- 72% of the principals who responded said that they would encourage competition in activities that they don't already offer at their schools in order to gain points toward winning the cup
  - Kentucky and Texas (UIL) are models for this association
  - Project starting with competitions in Fall 2010
  - Calendar meeting for all partners May 19, 2010 at NCSSM to prevent clogging calendar with activities on the same dates
  - No cost to TFL to become a partner
  - Schools will be divided into divisions (similar to 1A, 2A, 4A system for athletics) based on size
  - School annual fees pay salaries for director, etc. and other expenses (banners, t-shirts, judges)
  - Mr. Pfeiffer plans to travel with NCHSAA to meet with principals and AD's this fall to promote the association
  - They can link a partner's website to their own website
- Discussion centered on the advantage that the TFL and the two districts in the state could ultimately benefit from partnering with the association since there is the opportunity to see programs begin in schools that don't already have them OR that small programs that don't compete often will find it beneficial to compete more and recruit new members in order to help them get more points toward winning the cup. Since the TFL would incur no costs and does not give up its autonomy, a trial run may be a good idea.
- Motion to partner with the NCASA for one year (with option to continue in later years) by Chris Rocca; second by Suzanne Sell
  - Passed by unanimous consent

#### IV. Seventy-First High School (Fayetteville) added to calendar on September 18, 2010

- Tentative and/or POSSIBLE dates for some other tournaments that have not yet announced dates AS WELL AS sites that have stated they MAY have a tournament in the coming year:
  - Emory (possibly the last weekend of January)
  - Harvard (most likely Presidents' Day weekend—weekend of February 19)
  - Pine Forest High School (possibly February 5)
  - Carolina West districts (tentatively March 18-19)
  - Duke
  - SandHoke Early College
  - Reid Ross Classical/Cape Fear (joint tournament)
  - Massey Hill Classical High School
  - Chase High School
- All coaches are encouraged to choose dates ASAP in order to get them on the calendar

#### V. Discussion concerning both the trend that has overtaken Public Forum (that it is becoming more like Policy Debate and is barely recognizable as the debate form that it was originally designed to be) and the current movement on the part of the NFL to "sell" Public Forum topics to sponsors.

- Keith Pittman explained that the NFL is currently taking sponsorship money from corporations, organizations, etc. in exchange for broad topic areas for Public Forum topics. The topic-writing committee then is charged with writing a monthly topic within the framework of that broad topic area.
- Chris Rocca expressed concern that this trend then makes the Public Forum round a platform from which students express their opinions about the topic, often using materials that can seem like propaganda from the very organizations that are paying for the topic to be used, in an effort to persuade "lay" judges to subscribe to the sponsor's beliefs.

- Chris suggested that he would like to draft two resolutions to the NFL: one concerning the current movement toward policy-style debating in Public Forum, and one concerning the trend of allowing organizations to “purchase” Public Forum topics.
- After the resolutions are drafted, Chris will send them to the committee for a vote before they are sent to the NFL.

#### VI. 2011 TFL State Tournament

##### A. Tournament to be held April 8-9, 2011

- Motion by Melissa Cain; second by Chris Rocca
- Passed unanimously

##### B. Bid form will largely remain the same—there will be a few alterations.

- Motion to change bid POSTMARK deadline to October 16, 2011 by Suzanne Sell; second by Melissa Cain
- Passed unanimously

C. Discussion that there were some complaints at the 2010 State Tournament that students were observing preliminary rounds of debate, perhaps flowing the round, and then debating against some of the students in that round later in the competition. Additionally, there were some students and judges who were late for rounds because they were observing in preliminary rounds in patterns other than their own. Suggested that we not allow anyone to observe in rounds until elimination rounds, or perhaps until finals.

- Motion to table until November meeting so that we can get more information before a decision is rendered by Melissa Cain; second by Suzanne Sell
- Accepted by unanimous consent

D. Discussion that the host school be required to provide a number of judges above and beyond what their judging requirement already is for competing at the tournament. At the 2010 State Tournament, one factor that made it difficult to stay on schedule was the serious lack of judges. It may become necessary to add a requirement for additional judges to the bid package. It would be necessary for some of those judges to be trained IE/PFD judges, and it would also be necessary for some to be trained LD judges. Since the bid package is due in October, and the host is determined at the November meeting, the host school/coach would have ample time to recruit and train additional judges. The host school would still be paid the typical “per head” amount of \$5 for each of these additional judges. The committee along with the tournament director and manager would support the host coach by providing suggestions for where to recruit judges and would also continually remind and encourage the host coach to find the necessary judges before the tournament.

- Motion to require host school to provide 15 extra, trained, adult judges (10 IE/PFD and 5 LD) and that this information be added to the bid package by Suzanne Sell; second by Melissa Cain
- Passed unanimously

E. Discussion concerning the judge quota that was used at the 2010 TFL State Tournament. It did not provide the necessary judges to run an efficient tournament. The committee discussed both the judge ratio (number of judges needed per entry) and the number of judges that schools are allowed to hire. The committee was reminded that the tournament manual for the 2010 tournament already stipulated that no school was allowed to hire LD judges. We did find that several schools hired numerous IE judges, and there were many schools that brought no Congress judges. In at least two cases, registered schools did not register any adult judges at all. It was decided that there should be a number of changes. First, that the judge ratio should be altered for both LD and IE/PFD. It was also decided that schools should not be able to hire Congress judges, though the ratio of Congress judges would not need to be changed (it was deemed appropriate for each school with Congress entries to supply one adult judge— unless the school enters more than 10 Congress participants, in which case

they would need to provide two qualified adult judges, one of whom must be qualified to serve as a Parliamentarian). Additionally, it was decided that schools should not be able to hire more than 50% of the required number of IE judges (based on the ratio of 1 judge to every 5 entries). Finally, it was decided that all registered teams must provide at least ONE adult judge, regardless of entries, and that this judge had to remain at the tournament with the registered students for the duration of the tournament.

- Motion to change LD ratio to 1 judge per every 3 entries (or fraction thereof) by Melissa Cain; second by Scott Bennett
  - Passed unanimously
- Motion to change IE ratio to 1 judge per every 5 entries (or fraction thereof) with the stipulation that no school can hire more than 50% of its required judges by Melissa Cain; second by Scott Bennett
  - Passed unanimously
- Motion to require all schools with Congress entries to supply at least ONE adult Congress judge and that no Congress judges can be hired by Melissa Cain; second by Scott Bennett
  - Passed unanimously
- Motion to require all registered schools to provide at least ONE adult judge regardless of entries and that this judge must remain at the tournament site with the students for the duration of the tournament by Suzanne Sell; second by Melissa Cain
  - Passed unanimously

F. Motion to table discussion concerning double-entries between debate and IE until November meeting to allow for more research into whether the extemp draw, new judge ratio, or a new schedule will allow for such double-entries by Suzanne Sell; second by Melissa Cain

- Passed by unanimous consent

G. Item concerning changing the name of the TFL Student of the Year Award to the John Woollen Award for Excellence in Speech and Debate was tabled pending the results of item F above.

H. Discussion concerning new events and/or combining events resulted in no changes. The committee decided by unanimous consent that there would be no new events added for the 2011 State Tournament and that it was not necessary to combine events such as Oratorical Declamation and Oral Interpretation as numbers are high enough so as not to warrant such action.

I. After discussing an email that the committee received concerning the sweepstakes formula for the State Tournament, the committee decided by unanimous consent not to make any changes to the existing sweepstakes formula. It was pointed out that the existing sweepstakes formula ensures that the schools with the most state champions will be rewarded with more sweepstakes points. In this manner, the more individual state champions, the better the chance that the school will be the state champion. Furthermore, it was determined that newer events such as OI, Declamation, etc. should be awarded sweepstakes points. While we understand that the NFL considers many of these events to be supplemental events, the TFL State Tournament is not a regional qualifying tournament for NFL Nationals, and is really not affiliated with the NFL in any way.

J. Additional State Tournament concerns

- Motion that all schools planning to compete at the TFL State Tournament be required to have an adult present at pre-registration (and that no pre-registrations can be "called in" to the committee) by Melissa Cain; second by Suzanne Sell
  - "Calling in" registrations makes it difficult to receipt money. It is preferred that the treasurer be able to finish pre-registration and take all money to the bank before the close of business. At

the 2010 tournament, it took a great deal of time to locate some coaches for payment, and Ms. Cain was unable to get to the bank before it closed.

- “Calling in” registrations makes it impossible for coaches to visually check the registration forms to ensure that students are accurately registered for the events in which they should be entered.
- “Calling in” registrations makes it difficult for the tournament director to complete the registrations for the coaches who are present at pre-registration. For instance, there were numerous occasions at the 2010 tournament pre-registration in which Keith Pittman had to stop what he was doing with a coach who was present at pre-registration to take calls from coaches who were attempting to complete registrations over the phone.
- “Calling in” registrations prevents the vice-chair from collecting any outstanding ballots for TFL Student of the Year and TFL Executive Committee.
- Those schools that have travel issues and may arrive just when the tournament is scheduled to start should send an adult ahead to complete pre-registration.
- Passed unanimously
- Motion to review the method for breaking ties in IE and bring back speaker points (provided that there be a scale for the number of speaker points that should be awarded for each rank) by Melissa Cain; second by Suzanne Sell
  - Speaker points are awarded at local tournaments, and it is the most common method of breaking ties.
  - The manual will be revised at the November meeting to make the method for breaking ties easier to understand
  - Passed unanimously
- Scott Bennett recommended that speed ballots still be used at the State Tournament, but that we publish that information in the manual and explain our reasoning behind using them.
- Chris Rocca recommended that Keith Pittman (as Chair) publish “bullet notes” for coaches with any changes that have been made to the State Tournament manual and the most common misconceptions about the State Tournament (including differences between the State Tournament and district tournaments/local tournaments).
- Chris Rocca recommended that the committee address one specific misconception about the State Tournament that became a real issue at the State Tournament in 2010. There is no deadline for starting the last round on Friday night at the State Tournament. At the 2010 tournament, many students stated that several adults entered the student lounge and told people they could leave because we cannot start a round after a certain time. There were students who left the tournament site and who had to forfeit rounds because of this misinformation. The misconception stems from a tendency for some coaches to confuse the NFL rule that applies to district tournaments with the TFL State Tournament. Since the TFL is not affiliated with the NFL, we are not bound by their rules.
  - This will be addressed in the bullet notes that Keith Pittman will publish later.

VII. The committee discussed the new supplemental debate event that will be offered at NFL Nationals this summer. This 16-minute one-on-one debate is a modification of Parliamentary Debate, with a few changes. It requires a significant amount of preparation, but also the ability to extemporize speeches. Each debater gives three speeches in the round (two of which are rebuttals); there is a cross-examination period; and all time is protected. Students debate a different topic each round. Debaters are not allowed to bring prepared speeches or “tubs” of evidence into the

competition room. While the committee is NOT proposing that the new event be added to the State Tournament at this time, we encourage coaches to consider offering this event at their own local tournaments in an effort to stir up interest in debate.

- Keith Pittman, Scott Bennett, and Suzanne Sell expressed interest in offering this event at their own tournaments during the 2010-2011 school year.
- Suzanne Sell will draft a ballot for coaches to consider using for this event.

VIII. Melissa Cain will research whether Cathy Johnston has ever been inducted into the Virginia Sutherland Circle of Honor.

IX. Chris Rocca would like to encourage coaches to offer novice categories of events at their own tournaments, especially in light of the fact that there are very few "novice/JV" tournaments on the calendar.

X. The TFL Executive Committee will continue its tradition of meeting on Veterans' Day. The next meeting for the committee will be Thursday, November 11, 2010 at 9 am at Northwest Guilford High School.

- Committee will make necessary revisions to the State Tournament manual at that time.
- Bids for the 2011 State Tournament will be considered.
- All agenda items will be due to Keith Pittman no later than November 3, 2010.

XI. Motion to adjourn meeting (1:50 pm) by Chris Rocca; second by Scott Bennett

- Passed by unanimous consent